

Postural Control Measures of Neuromuscular Fatigue in Rugby Union

Jordan Troester

Bachelor of Science (Kinesiology)

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

7/11/2019

Faculty of Health, University of Technology Sydney

Sydney, Australia

Certificate of Original Authorship

I, Jordan Troester declare that this thesis, is submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy, in the Faculty of Health at the University of Technology Sydney. This thesis is wholly my own work unless otherwise reference or acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis. This document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution. This research is supported by the Australian Government Research Training Program.

Production Note:
Signature removed prior to publication.

7/11/2019

Acknowledgements

The journey that has resulted in the completion of this thesis would not have been possible without the support of all the people in my life who have helped and encouraged me through this process. I am truly grateful for the blessing that each one of you has been in my life. I am humbled to have had this opportunity and can only hope to acknowledge in a small way the contributions that so many have made.

The greatest possible appreciation and thanks go to my wife Jessica. She is far and away my biggest fan and thinks more of me than I could ever think of myself. She is the rock of our family and has sacrificed more through this process than I will ever be able to repay. While I bury myself in work and research, her hard work raising two kids and keeping our family running like a well-oiled machine deserves the real credit. Hopefully, I can at least start to repay all the hours I have spent working in the evenings instead of hanging out with you. I never would have imagined where life has led us so far and I can't wait to see where we go together. Jessica, Ethan, and Emma; you are my world.

Thanks do not even begin to express the gratitude I have for my supervisor Rob Duffield. He has been more a part of my life than almost anyone else over the last three years. He has seen me through one research project, two kids, two continents, three jobs, and innumerable challenges along the way; always offering empathy, wisdom and humor. As a true master, his guidance and feedback have been crucial to keeping this project on track and his productivity and capacity to provide the same support to all his research students that he has shown to me is absolutely inspiring.

Finally, I owe a great deal to the many people whom I have worked with and learned from professionally. The names could fill pages and I could never adequately acknowledge everyone, but a special thanks goes out to everyone at the NSW Waratahs: Haydn, John, Alex, Aaron, Luke, Marshall, Ben, Jack, Jason, Sean, Shane, Dave. You have each made an important contribution whether you knew it or not. I am also grateful for the support from the world-class staff and faculty at UTS who have helped make this impossibility a reality.

To my family and friends, and all who have believed in me, supported me, and encouraged me; I am humbled and grateful. May I have the same capacity to see the best that everyone around me is capable of and help them accomplish what they never dreamed possible.

Table of Contents

CERTIFICATE OF ORIGINAL AUTHORSHIP	II
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	III
TABLE OF CONTENTS	IV
LIST OF PUBLICATIONS INCLUDED IN THIS THESIS	VII
LIST OF TABLES	VIII
LIST OF FIGURES	IX
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	X
ABSTRACT	XI
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Overview	2
1.2 Thesis Aims.....	6
1.3 Justification of Thesis.....	7
1.4 Limitations.....	8
1.5 Delimitations.....	9
CHAPTER 2: REVIEW OF LITERATURE	11
2.1 Overview	12
2.2 Literature Search Methodology	14
2.3 Physical Demands of Rugby Union.....	17
2.3.1 Match Loads.....	17
2.3.2 Training Loads	20
2.4 Monitoring Fatigue in Applied Sport Settings.....	23
2.4.1 The Fatigue and Recovery Process.....	24
2.4.2 Models of Fatigue	28
2.4.3 Monitoring Neuromuscular Fatigue in Rugby Union	33
2.4.4 Fatigue Monitoring using Countermovement Jump in Rugby Union	40
2.5 The Role of Postural Control for Monitoring Neuromuscular Fatigue	50
2.5.1 Postural Control Methodology Considerations	52
2.5.2 Reliability of Postural Control Measures	61
2.5.3 Postural Control Responses to Fatigue	72
2.5.4 Summary; Conclusions on the Potential of Postural Control for Monitoring Neuromuscular Fatigue.....	93

CHAPTER 3: STUDY 1 – RELIABILITY OF SINGLE-LEG BALANCE AND LANDING TESTS IN RUGBY UNION; PROSPECT OF USING POSTURAL CONTROL TO MONITOR FATIGUE	96
3.1 Introduction	98
3.2 Methods	100
3.3 Results	104
3.4 Discussion	111
3.5 Conclusions	114
CHAPTER 4: STUDY 2 – THE INFLUENCE OF TRAINING LOAD ON POSTURAL CONTROL AND COUNTERMOVEMENT JUMP RESPONSES IN RUGBY UNION	116
4.1 Introduction	118
4.2 Methods	120
4.3 Results	124
4.4 Discussion	129
4.5 Conclusions	133
CHAPTER 5: STUDY 3 – POSTURAL CONTROL RESPONSES TO DIFFERENT ACUTE AND CHRONIC TRAINING LOAD PROFILES IN PROFESSIONAL RUGBY UNION ...	134
5.1 Introduction	136
5.2 Methods	138
5.3 Results	142
5.4 Discussion	147
5.5 Practical Applications	149
CHAPTER 6: STUDY 4 – MONITORING RESIDUAL 36H POST-MATCH NEUROMUSCULAR FATIGUE IN RUGBY UNION; A ROLE FOR POSTURAL CONTROL?	150
6.1 Introduction	152
6.2 Methods	154
6.3 Results	158
6.4 Discussion	163
6.5 Practical Applications	167
CHAPTER 7: DISCUSSION	168
7.1 Overview	169
7.2 Balance	171
7.3 Landing	178
7.4 Neuromuscular Fatigue Monitoring in Rugby Union; Options and Possibilities	183

CHAPTER 8: CONCLUSIONS	189
8.1 Thesis Aims.....	190
8.2 Key Findings	191
8.3 Conclusions	192
8.4 Practical Applications.....	192
8.5 Future Research Directions.....	193
CHAPTER 9: REFERENCES	194
APPENDICES	207
Appendix 1 – Ethics Approval Letter.....	208
Appendix 2 – Information Sheet and Informed Consent.....	209
Appendix 3 – Club Letter of Support.....	211
Appendix 4 – Summary of CMJ response to acute and chronic loads.....	212
Appendix 5 – Balance and Landing Data Collection Methods	213

List of Publications Included in This Thesis

Published

Troester, J., Jasmin, J., & Duffield, R. (2018). Reliability of single-leg balance and landing tests in rugby union; prospect of using postural control to monitor fatigue. *Journal of Sports Science and Medicine*, 17, 174-180.

Troester, J., Jasmin, J., & Duffield, R. (2019). The influence of training load on postural control and countermovement jump responses in rugby union. *Science and Medicine in Football*, DOI: 10.1080/24733938.2019.1598621

Troester, J. & Duffield, R. (In Press). Postural control responses to different acute and chronic accumulated training load profiles in professional rugby union. *Journal of Strength and Conditioning Research*.

Troester, J. & Duffield, R. (2019). Monitoring residual 36 h post-match neuromuscular fatigue in rugby union; a role for postural control? *European Journal of Sport Science* (2019), DOI: 10.1080/17461391.2019.1606941

List of Tables

Table 2.1 – Summary of rugby union match loads by position group

Table 2.2 – Summary of rugby union weekly training loads for pre-season and in-season periods

Table 2.3 – Summary of the reliability of common CMJ measures from investigations of rugby union and relevant team-sport athletes

Table 2.4 – Definition of common force plate measures used to describe fluctuations in the centre of pressure and related balance performance outcomes.

Table 2.5 – Definition of common force plate measures used to describe ground reaction force and related landing performance outcomes.

Table 2.6 – Summary of reliability results for single-leg balance studies

Table 2.7 – Summary of reliability results for single-leg landing measures

Table 2.8 - Mechanisms of Fatigue Affecting Postural Control

Table 2.9 – Summary of fatigue response of balance measures of static postural control

Table 2.10 – Summary of fatigue response of landing measures of dynamic postural control

Table 3.1 – Mean \pm SD training load and distance for weeks prior to reliability testing day1 and day 2

Table 3.2 – Mean \pm SD inter-trial reliability of single-leg balance test performed with eyes closed on a force plate

Table 3.3 – Mean \pm SD inter-trial reliability of single-leg landing test performed onto a force plate from 1 meter away with a self-selected jump height

Table 3.4 – Mean \pm SD inter-test reliability of single-leg balance test performed with eyes closed on a force plate

Table 3.5 – Mean \pm SD inter-test reliability of single-leg landing test performed onto a force plate from 1 meter away with a self-selected jump height

Table 4.1 – Mean \pm SD for training load measures on single-leg balance, single-leg landing and CMJ training days

Table 4.2 – Pre- and post- mean \pm SD, effect size (\pm 90% CL), and qualitative inferences for changes in single-leg balance, single-leg landing, and CMJ performance

Table 4.3 – Partial correlations (\pm 95% CL), standardized coefficients (β), and level of significance (p) for training load predictors of variance (% change) in single-leg balance, and CMJ variables

Table 6.1 – Comparison of match loads between higher and lower match load groups

Table 6.2 – Rested and 36h post-match balance and landing performance

Table 7.1 – Summary of single-leg balance variability and response to load

Table 7.2 - Summary of single-leg landing variability and response to load

List of Figures

Figure 2.1 - PRISMA flow diagram detailing the literature search and refinement process.

Figure 2.2 - Acute fatigue (A), functional overreaching (B), supercompensation (C) (Zatsiorsky and Kraemer, 2006)

Figure 2.3 - The Fatigue Continuum. Adapted from (Halson and Jeukendrup, 2004)

Figure 2.4 - Interdependent attributes of fatigue and their modulating factors (Enoka and Duchateau, 2016)

Figure 2.5 - Classic fatigue model consisting of central mechanisms of muscle activation and peripheral mechanisms of contractile function (Enoka, 2015).

Figure 2.6 - Prevalence of performance tests used in high performance sports (Taylor et al., 2012)

Figure 5.1 – Mean \pm SD for acute sRPE-TL, TD, HSR (A,B,C), chronic sRPE-TL, TD, HSR (D,E,F) and acute to chronic workload ratios (ACWR) for sRPE-TL, TD, HSR ratio (G,H,I) under normal, spike, and higher load profiles.

Figure 5.2 – Mean \pm SD for postural control measures on the non-dominant (ND) and dominant (D) legs for single-leg balance sway velocity (SV) (A), single-leg landing relative peak force (PF) (B), relative impulse (IMP) (C) and time to stabilization (TTS) (D) under normal, spike, and higher load profiles.

Figure 6.1 – Mean difference (%) \pm 90% CL between rested and 36h post-match measures of A) sway velocity B) peak force C) impulse and D) time to stabilisation on non-dominant (ND) and dominant (D) legs for higher and lower match load groups.

Figure 7.1 – Summary comparison of practical evidence for ideal criteria of fatigue monitoring tools between CMJ, balance and landing tests.

List of Abbreviations

ACWR	Acute to chronic workload ratio
AP	Anterior-posterior vector
AU	Arbitrary Units
CK	Serum Creatine Kinase
cm·s ⁻¹	cm per second
CL	Confidence limits
CMJ	Countermovement Jump
ConDur	Concentric Duration
ConIMP	Concentric Impulse
CoP	Centre of Pressure
CV	Coefficient of Variation
D	Dominant leg
EC	Eyes Closed
EccDur	Eccentric Duration
EccRFD	Eccentric Rate of Force Development
EO	Eyes Open
ES	Effect Size
FFP	Functional Fatigue Protocol
FT:CT	Flight Time to Contraction Time ratio
GRF	Ground Reaction Force
h	Hours
HSR	High Speed Running
ICC	Intraclass Correlation coefficient
IMP	Relative landing impulse
JH	Jump height
m·s ⁻¹	Metres per second
MF	Mean Force
ML	Medio-lateral vector
MP	Mean Power
ND	Non-dominant leg
NMF	Neuromuscular Fatigue
PF	Relative peak landing force
RFD	Rate of Force Development
SD	Standard deviation
sRPE-TL	Session rating of perceived exertion training load
SV	Sway Velocity
SV-AP	Antero-Posterior Sway Velocity
SV-ML	Medio-lateral Sway Velocity
SWC	Smallest Worthwhile Change
TD	Total distance
TL	Training Load
TTS	Time to Stabilisation
v	Vertical
vGRF	Vertical Ground Reaction Force

Abstract

Managing player load, fatigue and recovery in rugby union is deemed important given the potential impact on performance and injury risk (Cross et al., 2016; Quarrie et al., 2017). Whilst countermovement jump (CMJ) tests are the most common test of neuromuscular fatigue (NMF) in applied sport settings (Taylor et al., 2012), there remain some limitations to the real-world implementation of such testing for regular NMF monitoring purposes (Starling & Lambert, 2018). In particular, the maximal contractile nature of such tests results in reluctance of athletes to perform them in periods of post-match fatigue (Carling et al., 2018). As such, some have proposed tests of proprioception and postural control as novel tests of NMF, which provide the main advantage of being minimally physically demanding and not requiring maximal motivation from athletes (Austruy, 2016; Clarke et al., 2015). Therefore, the aim of this research was to assess the use of postural control measures of single-leg balance and landing on a force plate for monitoring neuromuscular fatigue in professional rugby union players.

Initially, the inter-trial and inter-test reliability of postural control measures were determined to understand the inherent variability of these tests (study 1). Then, the acute post-training changes related to specific internal and external load measures (study 2) as well as changes across different accumulated weekly load profiles (study 3) were determined in order to understand responsiveness of the tests. Finally, the use of single-leg balance and landing tests 36h post-match at the beginning of a weekly micro-cycle when monitoring tools are most applicable was investigated (study 4). To do the above, thirty-five male professional rugby union players were recruited to participate in this investigation. Measures of postural control included single-leg balance and landing tests performed on a force plate (9260AA6, Kistler Instruments, Winterthur, Switzerland) sampling at 1000 Hz. Participants performed balance tests by completing two 20 s trials on each leg with hands on hips and eyes closed.

Landing tests were performed by jumping off two legs from a starting point 1 m away and landing on one leg in the centre of the force plate. Participants performed three trials on each leg and were instructed to jump as high as possible whilst sticking and holding the landing. To investigate reliability, postural control tests were performed in the morning on the first day of training following 48 h rest on two consecutive training weeks with similar prior loads (study 1). To investigate the responsiveness to acute rugby union training loads, postural control tests were performed prior to training and again immediately following a typical training day consisting of three training sessions (gym, skills, and rugby) (study 2). To investigate the responsiveness to different accumulated internal and external load profiles, postural control tests were performed in the morning on the first day of the week across three distinct load profiles representing normal, spiked, and higher accumulated loads (study 3). And to investigate the responsiveness of postural control tests for monitoring fatigue post-match, postural control tests were performed in the morning on the first day of training following a bye week (rested) and again 7 days later on the first day of training 36h post-match (study 4).

The key findings within this research include:

Study 1

- Single-leg balance sway velocity demonstrates acceptable reliability, and superior reliability than sway velocity in the anterior-posterior and medio-lateral directions.
- Single-leg landing peak force and impulse demonstrate acceptable reliability, whilst time to stabilization should be used with caution due to the high variability and poor reliability between dominant and non-dominant legs.

Study 2

- Whilst countermovement jump eccentric rate of force development demonstrated the largest impairment following a typical rugby union training day, single-leg balance sway velocity on the non-dominant leg showed similar responsiveness to countermovement jump measures of jump height and concentric impulse.
- Bodyload, session rating of perceived exertion training load, and Banister's training impulse appear to be the main contributing factors to countermovement jump and balance impairment following typical rugby union training days.

Study 3

- Single-leg balance sway velocity was not significantly different between normal, spike, and higher three-week accumulated load profiles.
- Accumulated load profiles demonstrated a significant interaction in which single-leg landing impulse decreased over time under spike load conditions and increased over time under higher load conditions.

Study 4

- When monitoring postural control 36h post-match at the beginning of a weekly micro-cycle, most measures were within ranges observed without a prior match load (i.e. rested), however possibly small single-leg landing impulse impairments may remain.
- In higher match load groups, single-leg balance sway velocity may also demonstrate impairment 36h post-match.

Whilst the current investigation demonstrates potential responsiveness of single-leg balance sway velocity and single-leg landing impulse measures to acute and accumulated loads, the low signal to noise ratio of these tests may challenge their effectiveness. However, as demonstrated by the responsiveness of landing impulse and sway velocity on the dominant leg 36h post-match using specific thresholds for meaningful change derived from reliability results, there remains some potential for identifying individuals experiencing larger residual postural control disturbance resulting from higher match loads. It is likely that such athletes may be averse to maximal performance tests at the beginning of the weekly micro-cycle, and balance and landing tests could provide objective rationale for the appropriate modification of training and recovery. As a practical suggestion for implementation, it may be appropriate to use postural control tests early in the weekly micro-cycle to inform readiness to train, and CMJ tests later in the micro-cycle to inform readiness to perform.